

Performance Apparatus Civil Country (ASN) in Public Services (Policy Implementation Study based on the Regulation of the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022 concerning Management Performance Employee Apparatus Civil Country in Ward City Malang)

Dewi Citra Larasati ¹, Agus Sholahudin ², Kridawati Sadhana ³

^{1,2,3} Postgraduate Program in Social Sciences, Merdeka University, Malang

HOW TO CITE:

Dewi Citra Larasati , Agus Sholahudin, Kridawati Sadhana (2026). Performance Apparatus Civil Country (ASN) in Public Services (Policy Implementation Study based on the Regulation of the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022 concerning Management Performance Employee Apparatus Civil Country in Ward City Malang) International Journal of Special Education, 41(21s),1199 - 1216

ABSTRACT

This study aims to describe and analyze the Performance of State Civil Apparatus (ASN) in Public Service (Policy Implementation Study Based on the Regulation of the Minister of State Apparatus Empowerment and Bureaucratic Reform Number 6 of 2022 concerning the Performance Management of State Civil Apparatus Employees in Urban Villages) and identify factors that affect its implementation. The research was conducted in three sub-districts, namely Pandanwangi, Kotalama, and Gadang Villages, using a descriptive qualitative approach. The analysis of ASN performance is based on five dimensions of public service quality, namely tangible, reliability, responsiveness, assurance, and empathy, using the analysis of the Grindle Policy Implementation Model framework.

The results of the study show that the performance of civil servants in public services at the sub-district level is uneven and still faces structural, managerial, and behavioral challenges. In the tangible dimension, services are supported by the availability of infrastructure and the use of technology, but the quality of facilities between villages is not evenly distributed. The reliability dimension shows that the service has been running according to procedures, but it is not consistent due to the limitations of non-standard SOPs, the number and capacity of human resources, and the high workload. The responsiveness dimension shows that there are ASN initiatives to help the community, but it is not optimal due to limited resources and communication skills. In the assurance dimension, ASN has tried to provide certainty and a sense of security, although different information and limitations of apparatus competence are still found. Meanwhile, the empathy dimension shows that the friendly and caring attitude of ASN is not evenly distributed to the community.

This study shows that the performance of ASN in public services is influenced by supporting and inhibiting factors, which include performance management regulations, apparatus commitment, infrastructure support, technology utilization, human resource

COPYRIGHT STATEMENT:

Copyright: © 2026 Authors.

Open access publication under
the terms and conditionsof the Creative Commons
Attribution (CC BY)license
(<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>).

limitations, high workload, limited managerial authority, and aspects of apparatus behavior and communication. Analyzed through the Grindle Policy Implementation Model, the imbalance between the content of policy and the context of implementation is the main factor in the lack of optimal performance of civil servants at the sub-district level.

The novelty of this research lies in an integrative approach that connects the dimensions of public service quality, the value of ASN morals, and the Grindle Policy Implementation Model in analyzing the performance of ASN at the sub-district level. In addition, this study produced a model of ASN placement based on categorization and village grades as policy recommendations to realize the principle of the right man on the right place, increase justice through a reward system, and encourage a more contextual and sustainable improvement of the quality of public services.

Keywords : performance, public services, policy implementation, service quality.

1. Introduction

Bureaucracy plays a central role in modern governance as the primary instrument for delivering public services and ensuring societal welfare. In public administration, bureaucracy is expected to function as a neutral, professional, and efficient institution capable of translating public policies into tangible outcomes. Classical perspectives emphasize that bureaucracy should operate based on technical rationality and procedural consistency, minimizing political intervention to ensure objectivity and fairness in decision-making (Wilson, 1887; Weber, 1978). However, the idealized model of bureaucracy often contrasts with empirical realities, particularly in developing countries, where administrative systems are frequently characterized by inefficiency, weak professionalism, and governance deficits (Heady, 2001; Riggs, 1964).

In practice, bureaucracy is not merely a technical apparatus but also a political and social entity embedded within complex institutional dynamics. Its strategic position in policy formulation, implementation, monitoring, and evaluation makes it vulnerable to political capture and elite interests (Grindle, 1980; Peters, 2010). This condition gives rise to what is often described as “bureaucratic pathology,” characterized by maladministration, procedural rigidity, inefficiency, and service delivery failures (Caiden, 1991; Siagian, 2010). Such dysfunctions reduce public trust and weaken the legitimacy of

government institutions. Empirical studies further indicate that bureaucratic challenges are not limited to developing countries but also occur in advanced governance systems, reflecting the universal complexity of administrative performance (Brewer et al., 2022).

In Indonesia, bureaucratic reform has been a critical agenda, particularly since the post-1998 reform era, aimed at improving governance quality, accountability, and public service delivery. Various regulatory frameworks have been introduced to strengthen merit systems, performance management, and institutional accountability (Yusriadi, 2018). Despite these efforts, the implementation of bureaucratic reform often faces structural, managerial, and behavioral constraints, especially at the local government level, where public services are directly delivered to citizens (Andriyus, 2017; Haning, 2018).

At the frontline of public service delivery, local administrative units such as urban villages (kelurahan) play a crucial role in ensuring accessibility and responsiveness of services. However, empirical findings from this study indicate that the performance of civil servants at the village level remains uneven and constrained by multiple factors, including limited human resources, high workload, uneven competency distribution, and managerial limitations. Furthermore, inconsistencies in service quality dimensions such as reliability, responsiveness, and assurance suggest that policy implementation

has not been fully translated into optimal service outcomes.

A critical paradox emerges when macro-level institutional achievements are contrasted with micro-level realities. While local governments may receive national recognition for bureaucratic reform and performance management, service delivery at the grassroots level often remains suboptimal. This gap reflects a fundamental issue in public administration: the misalignment between policy design and implementation context (Grindle, 1980; Van Meter & Van Horn, 1975). Existing studies tend to focus either on performance measurement or policy frameworks, with limited integration between these perspectives.

To address this gap, this study adopts an integrative approach by combining public service quality dimensions (Parasuraman et al., 1988) with the policy implementation framework. Specifically, it applies the Grindle model to examine how the interaction between policy content and implementation context shapes civil servant performance in public service delivery. By focusing on urban village administration, this research provides a contextualized understanding of bureaucratic performance at the frontline level, where policy outcomes are directly experienced by citizens.

This research is novel through the integration of ASN BerAKHLAK values as an empirical analytical lens, not merely as normative jargon for personnel policy. The findings show that BerAKHLAK values are internalized in service practices at a high level. depth Which different between ward, And very influenced by local leadership, work culture, and performance management systems operating at the grassroots level of bureaucracy. The novelty of this research also lies in the application of the Grindle Policy Implementation Model at the sub-district level with a focus on on performance ASN as object policy. Study This enrich policy implementation studies by showing the success or obstacles to performance ASN is not only determined by the clarity of policy (*content of policy*), but also by the micro implementation context, such as limited human resources, local power relations, social pressure from the community, and cross-sector workloads that are often not reflected in formal policy planning.

This study ultimately found a model for civil servant (ASN) placement in urban villages, based on empirical findings that the Malang City

Government's employee placement policy has not fully considered the complex characteristics of urban villages as the frontline of public services. This *mindset* has resulted in the implementation of employee placement policies *within* urban villages not being based on organizational needs and actual workloads. This suggests that the implementation of placement policies is merely administrative. In urban villages, three characteristics of employees are still found: those who are sick, those who are approaching retirement, and *those who are troublemakers* in their previous offices. This is despite the fact that urban villages have a significant burden in carrying out mandatory functions. *Therefore, a reorientation of placement policies for urban civil servants is necessary.*

Conceptually, this model places the mapping and categorization of sub-districts as the primary foundation for employee placement policies. Research findings reveal that civil servant placement has tended to be administrative and uniform, without differentiation based on regional risk, population size, or the complexity of social problems faced by each region. ward. Whereas, third locus study show characteristics which is very diverse that is ward with density resident tall And potential conflict social more big need ASN with experience Work Which more mature, competence communication public Which strong, and abilities managerial adaptive. Based on condition the, model This propose grade determination ward (*Grade A, B, And C*) as instrument policy to ensure the principle *of the right man on the right place*. The grade of the sub-district is determined through indicator objective, covering wide region, amount resident, number of RW/RT, characteristics public, as well as potential vulnerability region (disaster, conflict social, crime, And issue health). Results mapping This then become the basis for formulating ASN needs, both in terms of the number of employees, background behind education, competence technical And social, and experience Workplace adjustments. Adjusting ASN needs based on sub-district grade is directly relevant to empirical findings at the research site. In Pandanwangi Sub-district, for example, the high burden of authority is not matched by the adequacy and quality of staff. employee, so that bring up burden Work double And decline innovative power ASN. Temporary That, in Ward Tower And Old Town, complexity of the problem social And service demand presence ASN Which No just understand regulations,

but Also own sensitivity social And ability settlement problem in level local. Model This with thus reflect needs real field, not just approach normative policy.

Therefore, this study contributes to the literature by offering a comprehensive and integrative analysis of bureaucratic performance, highlighting the importance of aligning institutional design, human resource capacity, and implementation environments. The findings are expected to provide both theoretical insights and practical implications for strengthening bureaucratic reform and improving public service delivery in developing country contexts.

2. Methodology

This research uses a qualitative approach with a descriptive-analytical approach. This approach was chosen because this research aims to understand bureaucratic phenomena in depth, particularly regarding the roles, dynamics, and problems that arise in the practice of public administration. Qualitative research allows researchers to explore the meanings, perceptions, and experiences of actors involved in the bureaucracy contextually. According to Creswell (2016), qualitative research is a method for exploring and understanding the meaning of social or humanitarian issues. Meanwhile, Moleong (2018) states that qualitative research aims to understand phenomena holistically through descriptions in words and language.

This research was conducted at government agencies relevant to the bureaucracy study. The research focused on: 1) The role of bureaucracy in public services, 2) Neutrality and professionalism of the bureaucracy, 3) The influence of political intervention in the bureaucracy, 4) The impact of bureaucratic performance on society. This focus determination aims to limit the scope of the research to be more focused and in-depth. The data sources in this study consist of primary data obtained directly through *in-depth interviews* and field observations. Secondary data were obtained from official government documents, laws and regulations, scientific journals and reference books, archives, and reports related to bureaucracy.

Sugiyono (2019) explains that primary data sources are data obtained directly from primary sources, while secondary data are supporting data obtained from documents or literature. The data collection techniques used included in-depth

interviews to obtain information directly from informants regarding bureaucratic practices and their dynamics. Observations were conducted to directly observe public service processes and bureaucratic behavior in carrying out their duties. Official documents, reports, and relevant archives were used to supplement the data. According to Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña (2014), a combination of data collection techniques is necessary to increase the validity and depth of the information.

This study used a *purposive sampling technique*, namely the selection of informants based on certain criteria relevant to the research objectives, such as: State civil servants (ASN), structural officials, and the public who use public services. Patton (2002) stated that purposive sampling is used to select informants who are considered to have the most knowledge and understanding of the phenomenon being studied. Data analysis in this study used the interactive model from Miles, Huberman, and Saldaña (2014), which involved data reduction by sorting and simplifying data obtained in the field. The data was organized in narrative, tabular, or matrix form for easy understanding. Extracting meaning from the analyzed data and double-checking the research findings. Data validity testing ensures data validity, using source triangulation techniques (comparing data from various informants), method triangulation (interviews, observations, documentation), and member checking (confirming data with informants). Lincoln and Guba (1985) state that data validity in qualitative research can be tested through credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability.

The review indicates that qualitative studies dominate research on civil servant performance because bureaucratic performance is strongly influenced by organizational context, leadership, institutional culture, and policy implementation processes. Case study designs are the most frequently employed because they provide comprehensive explanations of administrative practices within specific governmental settings. Phenomenological research contributes to understanding the perceptions and experiences of civil servants and service users, whereas grounded theory is valuable for developing new conceptual explanations of bureaucratic behavior. Ethnographic studies, although relatively limited, enrich the literature by revealing informal organizational norms and everyday administrative practices.

Despite these methodological strengths, previous qualitative studies exhibit several limitations. First, most investigations focus on single-case organizations, limiting cross-institutional comparison. Second, relatively few studies integrate policy implementation theory with public service quality frameworks. Third, qualitative evidence regarding the

implementation of **Ministerial Regulation of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform No. 6 of 2022** remains scarce because the regulation is relatively recent. Finally, limited research has examined frontline public service institutions, particularly urban villages (*kelurahan*), where interactions between policy implementation and citizen service occur directly.

Table 1. Synthesis of Qualitative Methods in Previous Studies

Method	Typical Data Collection	Main Research Focus	Strength	Limitation
Case Study	Interviews, observation, documents	Policy implementation, organizational performance	Rich contextual explanation	Limited generalizability
Phenomenology	In-depth interviews	Experiences and perceptions	Deep understanding of participants	Small sample size
Grounded Theory	Interviews and coding	Theory development	Generates new conceptual models	Time consuming
Ethnography	Participant observation	Bureaucratic culture	Reveals hidden organizational practices	Long fieldwork required

Accordingly, the present study adopts a descriptive qualitative case study approach to investigate the implementation of performance management policy at the urban village level. By integrating the Grindle Policy Implementation Model, SERVQUAL dimensions, and the ASN BerAKHLAK core values, this research extends previous methodological approaches and provides a more comprehensive understanding of civil servant performance within its organizational and policy context.

3. Results

Based on the research results in Dewi Citra Larasati's dissertation (2026), the performance of State Civil Apparatus (ASN) in public services at the village level shows suboptimal achievements and tends to be uneven across regions. The analysis was conducted using five dimensions of public service quality, namely *tangible*, *reliability*, *responsiveness*, *assurance*, and *empathy*, and examined through the Grindle Policy Implementation

Model framework. In the *tangible dimension*, the results of the study indicate that public services have been supported by the availability of facilities and infrastructure and the use of technology. However, the quality of service facilities is still uneven in each village, thus affecting the comfort and effectiveness of services to the community (Larasati, 2026). Furthermore, in the *reliability dimension*, public services have basically been running according to established procedures. However, consistency in service implementation remains a major obstacle, mainly due to limited human resources and an unbalanced workload. This indicates that operational standards have not been fully implemented optimally in the field (Larasati, 2026). In the *responsiveness dimension*, ASN is considered quite responsive in responding to community needs, but there are still delays in completing certain services. This condition indicates that the speed of service has not fully

met the public's increasingly high expectations for the quality of public services.

Meanwhile, in the *assurance dimension*, aspects of service guarantees such as certainty of time, cost, and procedures have begun to be implemented, but have not yet fully instilled a sense of trust in the public. This is related to the persistence of uncertainty in some administrative service processes. Meanwhile, in the *empathy dimension*, ASN have demonstrated efforts in providing friendly and communicative services. However, a personal approach in understanding community needs still needs to be improved so that services become more humane and oriented towards public satisfaction. Overall, the results of this study indicate that the performance of the bureaucracy at the village level still faces various challenges, both from the structural, managerial, and behavioral aspects of the apparatus. Factors such as limited resources, imbalanced workload, and less than optimal policy implementation are the main obstacles to improving the quality of public services.

4. Discussion

Bureaucracy, as the primary instrument in public administration, holds a strategic position in realizing state goals, particularly in the provision of quality public services. As Lumbanraja, Victor et al. (2025) argue, bureaucracy functions not only as a policy implementer but also as a means for the state to meet public needs through the provision of public goods and services. This demonstrates that the existence of bureaucracy cannot be separated from the state's responsibility to create comprehensive public welfare.

From a theoretical perspective, the concept of an ideal bureaucracy emphasizes the principles of neutrality, professionalism, and efficiency. Wilson emphasized that the bureaucracy must operate technically and free from political interference to maintain objectivity in policy implementation. This view aligns with the principle of the political-administrative dichotomy, where the bureaucracy is positioned as a rational policy implementer unaffected by practical political interests. Thus, the bureaucracy is expected to avoid various forms of distortion and dysfunction that often arise from power intervention (Lumbanraja, Victor et al., 2025).

Furthermore, a rational approach to bureaucracy emphasizes the importance of consistent rules and procedures in decision-making. This aims to ensure that similar issues are handled fairly and non-discriminatory. In this context, bureaucracy is viewed as a system capable of minimizing subjectivity and bias, enabling public services to operate transparently and accountably. Therefore, the principle of rationality is a crucial foundation for creating a bureaucracy oriented toward justice and legal certainty (Lumbanraja, Victor et al., 2025). However, empirical reality shows that bureaucracy does not always operate according to this ideal concept. Ramdhani et al. (2017) emphasized that bureaucracy is not only responsible for implementing policies but also must ensure the effectiveness and accuracy of public service targets. In practice, bureaucracy often faces various obstacles, such as low professionalism of its apparatus, weak oversight systems, and persistent political interference in administrative processes. These conditions prevent the bureaucracy from carrying out its functions optimally.

A frequently occurring phenomenon is what's known as a "sick bureaucracy," a bureaucracy that tends to be slow, cumbersome, inefficient, and prioritizes the interests of certain groups over the public interest. In this situation, the bureaucracy becomes a tool of power, exploited by certain parties to maintain their political dominance. This indicates a deviation from the principle of neutrality that should be the primary characteristic of bureaucracy. On the other hand, a bureaucracy with a high level of professionalism but not balanced by ethics and integrity can also create new problems. An overly powerful bureaucracy has the potential to become arrogant, difficult to control, and create public dependence on the administrative structure. Consequently, public initiative and participation are hampered, preventing the development process from being participatory and inclusive. This situation can ultimately reduce the quality of public services and weaken public trust in the government.

Based on this description, it is clear that the primary challenge facing bureaucracy lies in maintaining a balance between professionalism, neutrality, and integrity. Bureaucratic reform is a crucial step that must be undertaken continuously to ensure that the bureaucracy can function as an effective, efficient, and equitable public service instrument. Thus, the bureaucracy becomes not merely an administrative tool but also a key pillar

in realizing good *governance*. From an implementation perspective, several factors influence the implementation of empathetic service in Kotalama Urban Village. These include organizational factors, such as limited staff, high workloads, and the presence of employees approaching their retirement age. pension, impact on consistency attitude empathetic in service In addition, external environmental factors, such as the presence of service bureaus that jump the queue, contribute to stress for counter staff and disrupt the empathetic relationship between civil servants and the public. Weak supervision and disciplinary enforcement by management further reinforces the dependence of empathetic service on individual

initiative. Civil servants, not in an institutionalized service system. Based on Grindle's implementation model, it can be concluded that the implementation of service empathy in Kotalama Village still faces a gap between the substance of the policy and the context of its implementation.

The policy has provided a framework normative adequate, but limited resources, weak operational standards, and the influence of external factors mean that service empathy has not been implemented optimally and sustainably. Therefore That, strengthening system, leadership, And capacity apparatus become key to improving the quality of empathy in public services.

Table 2. Results Analysis Data Factor Supporters Ward Pandanwangi

Stage Data analysis	Results Analysis Data Ward Pandanwangi
Focus	Factors Which influential on implementation ASN performance in providing public services at the level ward. a. Factor Supporters
Data collection	Data obtained through interview four informant that is : 1. Head Ward 2. Secretary Ward

Stage Data analysis	Results Analysis Data Ward Pandanwangi
	3. Service Staff 4. Social Welfare Center
Reduction Data	1. Support means And infrastructure adequate 2. The existence of banner requirements in front entrance 3. Distribution room the work that comfortable 4. Supported performance by chairman RW 1- 14 5. The number of change which are more Good from the previous 6. There are electronic facilities such as computers, printers and air conditioning (AC). 7. Facility support place Wait service Which comfortable and clean toilet 8. At the front entrance there are members of the community security unit who are directing

Coding Data Compilation	1. Adequacy infrastructure 2. Transparency information service 3. Tata room Work Which support 4. Support stakeholders interest 5. Repair sustainable service 6. Support means technology and comfort 7. Comfort facility service 8. Support officer service front
Category Data	1. Means And service infrastructure 2. Transparency And convenience information 3. Comfort service environment 4. Support stakeholders interest 5. Repair quality service
Conclusion	Based on the results of the interview data analysis, supporting factors performance ASN in service public in Pandanwangi Village supported by availability means And service infrastructure Which adequate, order room Work Which comfortable, and supporting facilities such as computers, printers, air conditioning, waiting rooms, and clean toilets. Information transparency service through banner condition in area The front office makes it easier for the public to understand service procedures. Furthermore, support from local stakeholders, particularly the neighborhood unit (RW) head and community security officers, contributes to the smooth flow of services to the public. These findings indicate that support from physical facilities and transparency information, And collaboration with element The community is an important factor in improving the quality of public services in Pandanwangi Village.

Table 2. Results Analysis Data Factor Supporters Gadang Village

Stage Data analysis	Results Analysis Village Data Tower
Focus	Factors that influence the implementation of ASN performance in providing public services at the sub-district level a. Factor Supporters
Data collection	Data obtained through interview four informant that is : 1. Head Ward 2. Secretary Ward 3. Service Staff 4. Chairman LPMK
Reduction Data	1. Means And infrastructure influence performance ASN 2. Means And infrastructure in accordance standard And adequate 3. The existence of room Wait, toilet, place parking, room meeting, division of space for each section 4. The existence of taken WA

Coding Data Compilation	Role means infrastructure to Performance of conformity to infrastructure standards Completeness facility service Innovation service based technology
Category Data	Availability And standard means infrastructure Completeness of service facilities Innovation And support service technology
Conclusion	Based on results analysis data interview, factor The performance of civil servants in public services in Gadang Village is supported by the availability of standard and adequate service facilities and infrastructure. Complete service facilities, such as waiting rooms, toilets, parking lots, meeting rooms, and the division of workspaces for each section head, create a environment Work Which conducive And support the smooth running of services to the public. In addition, service innovation through utilization Takon WA strengthen access to information and communication between ASN and the public. Findings This show that support facility physique adequate and technology-based service innovations are factors important in increase performance ASN in Ward Tower.

Stage Data analysis	Results of Village Data Analysis Old Town
Focus	Factors Which influential on implementation ASN performance in providing public services at the level ward. a. Factor Supporters
Data collection	Data obtained through interview four informant that is : 1. Head Ward 2. Secretary Ward 3. Service Staff 4. Chairman LPMK
Reduction Data	Means And infrastructure like wifi, computer, printer and waiting room
Coding Data Compilation	Availability means infrastructure service
Category Data	Means And service infrastructure
Conclusion	Based on results analysis data interview, factor performance support ASN in public services in Kotalama Subdistrict come from from availability means And infrastructure service Basic facilities, such as Wi-Fi networks, computers, printers, and waiting rooms. The availability of these facilities supports the smooth running of administrative services and increases public convenience in accessing services. These findings indicate that, despite various other limitations, support for service infrastructure remains adequate. become factor important in support performance ASN in Ward Old town.

Table 4. Results Analysis Data Factor Inhibitor Ward Pandanwangi

Stage Data analysis	Results Analysis Data Ward Pandanwangi
Focus	Factors Which influential on implementation ASN performance in providing public services at the level ward b. Inhibiting Factors
Data collection	Data obtained through interview four informant that is : 1. Village Head 2. Secretary Ward 3. Service Staff 4. Community Health Center

Stage Data analysis	Results Analysis Data Ward Pandanwangi
Reduction Data	1. The employee placement (mutation) system does not take into account the competency, work experience and educational background of employees. 2. Malang City Government does not pay attention to the workload of sub-districts 3. The city government does not place the right people in strategic positions (employee capacity and professionalism), for example: the secretary position is filled by someone who cannot operate a computer. 4. The number of personnel/sub-district employees does not match the Job Description 5. Delegation task from cashier Which other Because No able to carry it out thereby increasing the workload of other cashiers in the sub-district. 6. <i>Mindset</i> City Government Malang Still consider ward it is not a priority as the front line of public service implementation 7. No There is system <i>reward</i> and <i>punishment</i> Which clear 8. No existence definition performance clear 9. <i>reward and punishment</i> Which No clear This causes innovation power to be low and tends to be apathetic

Coding Data Compilation	1. Mismatch employee placement 2. Mandatory 27 delegation authority 3. Placement people who not exactly 4. Lack employee 5. Burden task double 6. Mindset City Government Ward No priority 7. <i>Reward and punishment</i> No clear 8. Definition performance Which unclear 9. Power Innovation low And apathetic
Category Data	1. Policy <i>placement</i> Which No appropriate (1, 3) 2. Burden Work Which heavy (2, 5) 3. Ethos Work (8) 4. Availability And adequacy HR (4) 5. <i>Reward and punishment</i> (6, 7)
Conclusion	Based on the results of the interview data analysis, the inhibiting factors Which influence performance ASN This originate The Malang City Government's mindset that urban villages are not a priority as the frontline of service delivery has resulted in inaccurate implementation of the placement policy. Urban villages, which received 27 delegations of authority, were not matched by the number of employees . Which reliable, experienced And adequacy amount personnel in ward For support function <i>mandatory</i>

Stage Data analysis	Results Analysis Data Ward Pandanwangi
	This creates a double burden for village employees, low innovation, and apathy due to unclear <i>reward and punishment arrangements</i> .

Table 4 . Results Analysis Data Gadang Village

Stage Data analysis	Results Analysis Village Data Tower
Focus	Factors Which play a role on implementation performance ASN in providing public services: b. Inhibiting Factors
Data collection	Data obtained through interview four informant that is : 1. Village Head 2. Secretary Ward 3. Service Staff 4. Officer Social Welfare Center

Reduction Data	1. The city government demands good service, but the personnel placed in the sub-districts do not match the needs of the personnel in the sub-districts. 2. Employees who are placed in the sub-district usually have the following characteristics: a) transferred from the department due to problems, b) retired Which motivation study low 3. The city government does not place inappropriate employees in strategic positions. 4. Amount personnel No in accordance with job description 5. Burden Work Which overflow height from agencies 6. <i>Reward</i> only in the form of allowance even that is generalized. 7. <i>reward and punishment</i> Which No clear This causes innovation power to be low and tends to be apathetic 8. Management talent the concept There is However all That just the legality of fulfilling administrative reporting requirements 9. No to be clear definition performance like What 10. has been no commitment from the Malang City Government to carry out standardization, especially personnel development. 11. Placement employee No balanced with appropriate technical training for sub-districts such as: public speaking 12. The sub-district does not have the authority to conduct technical training. 13. The city and sub-district governments usually tend to wash their hands of the situation if the sub-district encounters difficulties.
----------------	--

Researchers Also try synthesize And compile results Which researchers obtained from the previous sub-chapter regarding supporting and inhibiting factors for performance ASN in give service public in Ward. Following This is the result of a compilation of supporting factors for ASN performance in public services across sub-districts (Pandanwangi, Gadang, and Kotalama) which integrates all the results of interview data reduction:

Performance Civil servants (ASN) in public services in Pandanwangi Village are supported by a commitment to service ethics and the principle of non-discrimination. They demonstrate a friendly, polite, and open attitude in explaining service procedures to the public. Furthermore, they are supported by the availability of relatively adequate service facilities and infrastructure, accompanied by an organized and comfortable work environment. Supporting facilities such as computers, printers, Air conditioning, waiting rooms, and clean toilets strengthen the *tangible dimension* while providing comfort for the public in accessing services.

Furthermore, the transparency of service information conveyed through requirements banners and the role of community security officers in directing the public contribute to the smooth flow of services. The existence of relatively clear service standard operating procedures (SOPs) and the use of service technology, such as the Suradi and Srikandi applications, also strengthen service reliability and responsiveness. Furthermore, leadership village head Which relatively present And responsive become important factors In maintaining coordination, strengthening internal coordination and resolving service constraints in the field. Support from the RW Head and the improvement in service quality compared to previous levels demonstrate the development of cooperation and concern in public service.

However thus, there is a number of factor inhibitor Which affects the optimization of ASN performance. The imbalance between the number of employees and the workload, particularly due to the vast area and large population, leads to a backlog of work for one Section Head. The structural division of tasks

also limits the flexibility of job transfers when authorized employees are absent. On the other hand, the low level of understanding among some public to procedure service as well as existence pressure from Parties who claim to be close to officials or council members also pose a challenge in maintaining consistency and objectivity in service.

Gadang Subdistrict demonstrated the strongest supporting factors compared to the other two subdistricts: internalization of the values of excellent service and empathy. ASN reflected from attitude Be patient, concern to group prone to, and the willingness of officials to directly assist the community. Village head leadership that encourages internal coordination and collective work is a key driver of sustainability. service. In addition That, innovation service through application Takon WA improves access to information and strengthens the responsiveness of officials to public needs. A culture of discipline and mutual support among employees also contributes to stable service delivery, even under high workloads.

The inhibiting factors in Gadang Village tend to be technical and external. The limited number of counter staff has the potential to slow down service. when volume application increase. Change regulations from other agencies that are not immediately socialized often cause confusion at the community level. Besides That, Not yet availability system protection data based Digital technology demands high levels of vigilance from officials in safeguarding citizen data security. Social pressure from the public demands special treatment in the name of relation political Also become challenge alone, although so far it can still be managed normatively.

In Ward Old Town, factor supporters performance ASN relatively more limited. Availability means and infrastructure service base like Wi-Fi, computer, Printers and waiting rooms are the mainstays of the *tangible dimension* and help ensure the smooth running of the administrative service process. The commitment of officials to provide services without extortion and without discrimination remains the basic capital in build trust public. Experience Work part ASN It also helps in understanding service flows and the characteristics of the local community. Furthermore, internal leadership policies are often used as temporary solutions to address regulatory gaps or technical limitations in the field.

In contrast, inhibiting factors in Kotalama Urban Village are quite dominant and complex. The lack of standard and uniform service SOPs leads to procedural differences and inconsistent information among employees, which impacts the reliability and certainty of service. Limited human resources, coupled with age and approaching retirement, also reduce the responsiveness and accuracy of officers. The practice of service bureaus and queue-jumping also undermines the principle of fairness and creates psychological stress for counter staff. Weak internal discipline enforcement and minimal ongoing performance evaluation further reinforce structural barriers to public service.

In a way overall, factor supporters And inhibitor performance ASN in The three sub-districts demonstrated that the quality of public services is significantly influenced by human resource capacity, leadership, organizational culture, and the local social and structural context. These differences explain the variation in performance outcomes across sub-districts, even within the same policy and regulatory framework . Relevance of Research Results to Grindle's Policy Implementation Model Theory based on research results regarding performance State Civil Apparatus (ASN) in public services in Pandanwangi, Kotalama, and Gadang Sub-districts, implementation policy as arranged in Minister of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform Regulation Number 6 The year 2022 can be understood comprehensively through the Grindle Implementation Model, which emphasize on two dimensions main, *namely Content of Policy And Context of Implementation* .

In terms of policy content, Regulation of the Minister of Administrative and Bureaucratic Reform (PermenPANRB) Number 6 of 2022 contains normatively clear objectives, standards, and mechanisms to encourage improved ASN performance in public services. This is reflected in the following aspects: 1). The policy objectives have been understood by ASN at the sub-district level, particularly in promoting reliable, fast, ethical, and community-oriented services. 2). Service standards and performance indicators have become a reference in daily service practices. 3). The ASN BerAKHLAK values as part of the policy content have been internalized in the behavior of apparatus, as seen in polite, non-discriminatory, empathetic attitudes, and a commitment to free services. However, the effectiveness of the policy content still faces limitations, including : 1). SOP Which Not yet

fully standardized And uniform, 2). limited translation of policies into operational technical instructions, 3). and the less than optimal strengthening of ASN capacity through systematic training. 4). Conditions This show that in a way substance, *content of policy* Already adequate, but still requires strengthening in the operational aspects of the policy. 5). *Context of Implementation* (Context Implementation).

On dimensions context implementation, study find that The organizational and social environment significantly influences the successful implementation of public service policies at the sub-district level. Limited human resources are the dominant factors affecting the speed and consistency of service delivery. Burden Work Which tall, overflow task from OPD, as well as characteristics region and society (large population, low administrative literacy, and social pressure) form complex service dynamics. The leadership of the village head and internal coordination patterns are determining factors in maintaining the stability and quality of services, especially when policies are not fully supported by a strong system. The existence of actor external like bureau service as well as intervention social (claim closeness to officials) also influences perceptions and service practices in the field.

These findings indicate that although the policy has been well formulated, *the context of implementation* has not been fully supportive, thus affecting the overall performance of ASN. Based on the description of previous research that has been presented, it can be concluded that studies on bureaucratic reform, the performance of state civil servants, and the quality of public services have been carried out using various approaches. And focus analysis. Research the provide important contributions in understanding bureaucratic reform at the macro level, factors that influence employee performance, strategies for improving the quality of public services, and management of human resources for civil servants. However, most previous studies still place ASN performance in a structural, managerial, or administrative perspective, such as staffing adequacy, work discipline, supervision, and service facilities. Studies that specifically link ASN performance to the implementation of applicable performance management policies and the internalization of ASN core values in public service practices are still relatively limited, especially at the sub-district level as the frontline public service unit. Therefore, this study takes a position to complement and deepen previous

studies by focusing analysis on ASN performance. ASN in service public Which reviewed through implementation Ministerial regulation PANRB Number 6 Year 2022 as well as internalization mark ASN This research also considers the context of policy implementation at the sub-district level, so it is hoped that it will provide a more comprehensive understanding of the performance of ASN is not only administrative, but also substantively and contextually in public services.

This discussion places the research findings within the context of previous studies to identify common ground, differences in emphasis, and any additional contributions emerging from this study. Methodologically, the analysis was conducted using a descriptive qualitative approach, with stages of data reduction, coding, categorization, and verification of conclusions through triangulation. Relevance to the study of bureaucratic reform: strengthening the meaning of implementation at the basic service level . Yusriadi (2018) emphasized that bureaucratic reform has opportunities through e-government and human resource development, but faces obstacles such as corruption and a reform approach that has not addressed the root of the problem.

The findings of this study are in line with the fact that bureaucratic reform cannot be understood as a macro-normative agenda, but must be visible in service practices. public in unit at the forefront. On level ward, reform bureaucracy manifested through measurable aspects in the field, such as procedural certainty, service ethics, transparency, and performance accountability as emphasized in the implementation of PermenPANRB Number 6 of 2022. Thus, this study emphasizes the relevance of Yusriadi's bureaucratic reform ideas by shifting the focus from the "change agenda" to "implementation practices" at the basic service level. This means that bureaucratic reform is understood not merely as a concept, but as a very practical implementation reality. determined by context organization, source Power, And order manage supervision at the sub-district level.

Relevance to the study of public service quality: confirmation of supporting and inhibiting factors, as well as deepening the dimensions of ASN values and behavior . Research by Marza Alfariza et al. (2024) shows that the quality of public service influenced by tool Work, progress technology, availability devices (computers and printers), as well as inhibiting factors such as

limited human resources and public understanding of procedures. The results of this study are relevant to these findings, especially regarding the aspect of the quality of public services at the sub-district level. of course very determined by adequacy means, support technology, human resource capacity, and clarity of procedural information. However, study This give deepening Which more conceptual By positioning service quality not merely as a matter of facilities and procedures, but as an expression of ASN performance based on values. This in-depth analysis was conducted by mapping the categories of findings against ASN values. Moral (for example competence, ethics service, transparency procedures, and accountability) as a basis for interpreting why the quality of service can differ between sub-districts even though the formal policy framework is similar . say other, study This No only “confirm factors services”, but also shows how these factors are intertwined with the quality of the behavior of the apparatus as service implementers.

Relevance to the study of civil servant human resource management: from staffing adequacy to performance capacity in service Sofiana Dewi et al. (2019) emphasized that employee needs can be assessed through job analysis and workload analysis, and in the context studied, employee needs were deemed to have been met. This research is relevant in that the discourse on civil servant human resources is indeed important in explaining the quality of organizational performance. However, this study adds the perspective that "staffing adequacy" is not automatically synonymous with "substantive service performance." In service practice, the quality of civil servant performance is greatly influenced not only by the number of employees, but also by the capacity of implementation (understanding of procedures, communication accuracy, service ethics, consistent effective attendance). Then mapped in mark Moral And evaluated through SERVQUAL dimensions. Thus, this study complements previous HR studies by placing HR issues in the realm of performance experienced directly by the public as service users.

The relevance to the study of supervision, discipline, and performance lies in the expansion of formal indicators towards substantive performance quality. Rohman et al. (2021) emphasized that supervision and work discipline influence performance, with discipline being measured, among other things, through

indicators of attendance and compliance with regulations. This study's findings align with the notion that supervision and discipline remain important determinants of civil servant performance. However, this study broadens the understanding of discipline by more substantively distinguishing between administrative compliance and effective service accountability. This means that formal indicators such as attendance are important but insufficient to assess performance if they are not accompanied by civil servant engagement in service during working hours. In this context, the value of "Accountable" And "Loyal" No only understood as compliance to rules, but also the commitment to public service responsibilities as an organizational mandate . With thus, study This still relevant with framework Rohman et al., also provide interpretive depth on the meaning of discipline in public service. Relevance to the study of village employee performance: strengthening analysis through the integration of policies, values, and implementation contexts.

5. Conclusion

This model places sub-district mapping and categorization as the primary foundation for employee placement policies. Research findings reveal that civil servant placement has tended to be administrative and uniform, without differentiation based on regional risk, population size, or the complexity of social problems faced by each region. ward. Whereas, third locus study show characteristics which is very diverse that is ward with density resident tall And potential conflict social more big need ASN with experience Work Which more mature, competence communication public Which strong, and abilities managerial adaptive. Based on condition the, model This propose grade determination ward (*Grade A, B, And C*) as instrument policy to ensure the principle of *the right man on the right place* . The grade of the sub-district is determined through indicator objective, covering wide region, amount resident, number of RW/RT, characteristics public, as well as potential vulnerability region (disaster, conflict social, crime, And issue health). Results mapping This then become the basis for formulating ASN needs, both in terms of the number of employees, background behind education, competence technical And social, and experience Workplace adjustments. Adjusting

ASN needs based on sub-district grade is directly relevant to empirical findings at the research site. In Pandanwangi Sub-district, for example, the high burden of authority is not matched by the adequacy and quality of staff. employee, so that bring up burden Work double And decline innovative power ASN. Temporary That, in Ward Tower And Old Town, complexity of the problem social And service demand presence ASN Which No just understand regulations, but Also own sensitivity social And ability settlement problem in level local. Model This with thus reflect needs real field, not just approach normative policy.

Furthermore, this model also emphasizes the importance of establishing different performance allowances between sub-district levels. Research findings indicate that perception injustice in circles ASN ward, in where burden Work and high service risks are not accompanied by proportional performance rewards. Therefore, differentiation of performance allowances based on village grade is positioned as both a motivational instrument and a mechanism for organizational justice. The higher the village grade, the greater the responsibility, complexity, and risk of civil servant work, so it's logical that higher performance allowances are followed.

6. References

- Abdul Wahab, S. (2008). *Policy Analysis from Formulation to Implementation of State Policy* (2nd ed.). PT. Bumi Aksara.
- Addina, C., & Nasution, J. (2022). Importance Commitment Organization And Information Technology in an Effort to Support Employee Performance Improvement Strategies at PT. Eriadi Fatkhur Rokhman, Medan Accounting Services Office. *AKMAMI Journal: Accounting, Management, Economics*, 3 (2), 186–196. <http://jurnal.ceredindonesia.or.id/index.php/akmami/article/view/615%0Ahttp>
- ://jurnal.ceredindonesia.or.id/index.php/akmami/article/download/615/673 Andriyus. (2017). Development of Performance Management System The
- Bureaucracy of Local Government. *Advances in Social Science, Education and Humanities Research (ASSEHR)*, 163, 195–198.
- Field Communication and Information Public. (2022). City Malang Achieve BKN Award 2022. <https://malangkota.go.id/2022/08/10/kota-malang-raih-penghargaan-bkn-award-tahun-2022/>.
- Brewer, G. A., Kellough, J. E., & Rainey, H. G. (2022). The Importance of Merit Principles for Civil Service Systems: Evidence from the US Federal Sector. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 42 (4), 686–708. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0734371X211026008>
- Dwiyanto, A., Partini, Ratminto, Wicaksono, B., & Tamtari, W. (2008). *Bureaucratic Reform in Indonesia*. Gajah Mada University Press.
- Erlianti, D. (2019). Quality of Public Services. *Journal of Public Administration and Business*, 01, 9–18.
- Faeq, D. K., & Ismael, Z. N. (2022). Analyzing the Relationships Between Organizational Justice and Job Performance. *International Journal of Engineering, Business and Management*, 6 (5), 14–25. <https://doi.org/10.22161/ijebm.6.5.3>
- Fathin, A., Wolor, CW, & Utari, ED (2025). Employee Performance Analysis at PT X. *Journal of Management and Economics*, 2 (3), 431-442.
- Hanim, L., & Hakim, A. (2014). Factors Influencing the Performance of Government Officials Ward in Service Public in the Era Autonomy Area (Study in Gadang Subdistrict, Malang City). *Journal of Public Administration*, 2 (2), 350– 354.
- Haning, MT (2018). Bureaucratic Reform in Indonesia: A Review from a Public Administration Perspective. *Journal of Policy Analysis and Public Service*, 4 (1), 25–37. <https://journal.unhas.ac.id/index.php/jakpp/article/view/5902/3294>
- Irawan, I. (2024, April). The Head of Jodipan Village 'Emptied' His Office to Attend a Celebration, Only Sanctions Light. <https://malang-post.com/2024/04/30/lurah-jodipan-yang-kosongkan-kantor-untuk-hadiri-hajatan-hanya-disanksi-ringan/>.
- Kedungkandang District. (2024). *Villages in Kedungkandang District*. <https://keckedungkandang.malangkota.go.id/kelurahan/>.
- Gadang Village. (2024). *Geographic and Demographic Conditions*. <https://kelgadang.malangkota.go.id/syarat-geografis-dan-demografis/>.
- Lexy, MJ (2014). *Qualitative Research Methodology* (Vol. 33). PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Marza Alfariza, N., Muchsin, S., & Rahman Ilyas, T. (2024). Strategy Improving the Quality of Public Service Performance

of Civil Servants in Samaan Subdistrict. *Public Response* , 18 (1), 82–89.

- Maulidyah, YF, Muchsin, S., & Abidin, AZ (2019). Human Resource Capacity Development in Improving the Quality of Public Services. *Journal of Public Response* , 13 (4), 61–67.
- Ngo, L.V., Nguyen, N.P., Huynh, K.T., Gregory, G., & Cuong, P.H. (2020). Converting internal brand knowledge into employee performance. *Journal of Product and Brand Management* , 29 (3), 273–287. <https://doi.org/10.1108/JPBM-10-2018-2068>
- Nugroho, R. (2020). *Public policy: Policy dynamics, policy analysis, and policy management* . Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.
- Oktavisatrika, G. W., Muchsin, S., & Abidin, A. Z. (2019). Problems Public service Apparatus Government Ward (Studies Case In Office Bandulan Village, Sukun District, Malang City). *Public Response Journal* , 13 , 31–38. Paais, M., & Pattiruhu, J. R. (2020). Effect of Motivation, Leadership, and Organizational Culture on Satisfaction and Employee Performance. *Journal of Asian Finance, Economics and Business* , 7 (8), 577–588.
- Regulation Minister Utilization Apparatus Bureaucracy Number 6 year 2022 on the Management of Civil Service Employee Performance, Pub. L. No. 6 (2022).
- Government Regulation Number 17 of 2018 concerning Districts, Pub. L. No. 17 (2018).
- Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 81 of 2010 concerning the Grand Design of Bureaucratic Reform 2010 – 2025, Pub. L.No. 81 (2010).
- Regulation of the Mayor of Malang Number 81 of 2019 concerning the Position, Organizational Structure, Duties and Functions and Work Procedures of Sub-districts, Pub. L. No. 81, Malang City Government (2019).
- Regulation of the Mayor of Malang Number 110 of 2019 concerning the Delegation of Part of the Mayor's Authority to Sub-district Heads, Pub. L. No. 110, Malang City Government (2019).
- Rachman, M., & Marsuq, M. (2023). Structural and Cultural Reforms in the Indonesian Bureaucracy. *La Bisecoman Journal* , 4 (6), 125–134. <https://doi.org/10.37899/journalabisecoman.v4i6.840>
- Rahardjo, M. (2024). *Ask Answer Methodology Study Social Qualitative* (Suprpto & B. Meirina, Ed.; 3 ed., Vol. 3). Giri Prapanca Location.
- Ramadan, A., Muhammad, , & Ramadan, A. (2017). Draft General Public Policy Implementation. *Public Journal* , 1. www.jurnal.uniga.ac.id
- Ratminto, & Winarsih, AS (2010). *Management Service : Conceptual Model Development, Citizen Charter Implementation, and Minimum Service Standards* . Student Library.
- Ridwan, M., Mulyani, SR, & Ali, H. (2020). Improving employee performance through perceived organizational support, organizational commitment and organizational citizenship behavior. *Systematic Reviews in Pharmacy* , 11 (12), 839–849. <https://doi.org/10.31838/srp.2020.5.123>
- Rohayatin, T., Warsito, T., Personal, U., Nurmandi, A., Kumorotomo, W., & Suranto. (2017). Factors Causing Suboptimal Quality of Public Service Delivery in Government Bureaucracy. *Jurnal Caraka Prabhu* , 01 , 22–36.
- Rohman, F., Sunaryo, H., & Ridwan Peace be upon you, M. (2021). Influence Supervision, Discipline Work And Placement Work To Performance Employee (On Malang City Human Resources Development and Personnel Agency (BKPSDM).
- Sadhana, K. (2010). *Ethics Bureaucracy In Service Public* . CV. Citra. Sadhana, K. (2011). *The Reality of Public Policy* . UM Press.
- Santosa, P. (2008). *Public Administration: Theory and Application of Good Governance* . PT. Revika Aditama.
- Sholahuddin, A. (2021). *Social Research Methodology : Qualitative - Quantitative Perspective* . Eduliter.
- Siregar, Z. M. E., & Lubis, J. (2017). Merit system in the placement of civil servants and its effect toward performance of sub-district office in Labuhanbatu region nort Sumatra. *IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering* , 180 (1). <https://doi.org/10.1088/1757- 899X/180/1/012258>
- Sofiana Goddess, D., Cikusin, Y., & Suyeno. (2019). Analysis Need Employee at the Regional Personnel Agency of Malang City (Study at the Regional Personnel Agency Office of Malang City). *Public Response* , 13 (5), 53–58.
- Sugiyono. (2018). *Method Study Quantitative, Qualitative, And Combination (Mixed Methods)* . Alfabet.
- Suharno. (2013). *Fundamentals of Public Policy: Process Studies and Policy Analysis* . Ombak Publisher.
- Suratman. (2017). *Generation of Public Policy Implementation and Evaluation* . Capiya Publishing.
- Taufan. (2018). The Performance of Village Employees in Public Services in Tamalanrea Village, Tamalanrea District, Makassar City. *Suara Khatulistiwa Government Science Journal* , III , 134–150.

- Triemia, Maarif, S. M., Affandi, M. J., & Pawenary. (2019). Strategy Performance Improvement Employee On Company Construction. *BENEFIT: Journal Management And Business* , 4 (1), 54–68.
- Van Ryzin, G. G. (2011). Outcomes, process, and trust of civil servants. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory* , 21 (4), 745–760. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/muq092>
- Victor Lumbanraja, Rustiyana, Abdul Halil Hi Ibrahim, & Andik Riyanto. (2025). Bureaucratic Reform and Public Service Innovation in Indonesia : *Concepts, Development, Principles and Roles* . www.stardigitalpublishing.com
- Wahyuni, S., Yahya, M., & Sidin, US (2023). Analysis of Several Factors Affecting Employee Performance Using Web Systems at the Makassar City Population and Civil Registration Service. *INTEC Journal: Information Technology Education Journal* , 2 (1).
- Winarno, B. (2020). *Policy public: Theory, process, And studies case* (Revised edition).
- Yogyakarta: CAPS (Center of Academic Publishing Service).
- Yusriadi, Y. (2018). Reformation Bureaucracy Indonesia: Opportunity And Obstacle. *Journal of Public Administration : Public Administration Journal* , 8 (2), 178. <https://doi.org/10.31289/jap.v8i2.1824>

6. Acknowledgements (Optional)

The authors would like to express their sincere gratitude to all individuals and institutions who contributed to the completion of this research. Special appreciation is extended to the leadership and staff of Pandanwangi, Kotalama, and Gadang Urban Villages, Malang City, for granting research permission, providing access to research sites, and facilitating data collection throughout the study.

The authors are deeply grateful to the informants, including village heads, secretaries, administrative staff, community representatives, and all participants who generously shared their time, experiences, and valuable insights during the interview process. Their contributions were essential to the successful completion of this research. The authors also sincerely acknowledge the academic guidance and constructive recommendations provided by colleagues and reviewers during the preparation of this manuscript. Their valuable comments and suggestions significantly improved the quality, clarity, and academic rigor of this article. Finally, the authors express their appreciation to the Postgraduate Program in Social Sciences, Universitas Merdeka Malang, for providing academic supervision, institutional support, and a conducive research environment throughout this study. The authors declare that no specific grant from any funding agency in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors was received for this research.

7. Author Declaration

The author declares that there is no conflict of interest.